Humboldt State University Institute for Student Success January 16, 2014
Thomas Brown
tom@tbrownassociates.com
www.tbrownassociates.com

Academic advising is a form of teaching that is both complex and puzzling and its effectiveness depends on the sound use of multiple theories….

Don G. Creamer
Academic Advising, 2000

Critical Issues for Students of Color

- Difference between college and previous educational settings
- “Minority” for the first time
- Lack of mentors and role models
- Low expectations of faculty and peers
- Issues of identity development


Critical Issues for Students of Color

- Difference between college and previous educational settings
- “Minority” for the first time
- Lack of mentors and role models
- Low expectations of faculty and peers
- Issues of identity development

This session

- What is identity and why does it matter?
- What are some models of identity development?
- What is racial and minority identity development?
- How can understanding identity development enable educators to be more effective in their work with students of color?
- What are some practical implications and applications for supporting students of color?

Questions to consider

- How can I apply this to:
  - Classroom teaching
  - Improving climate—classroom and beyond
  - Orientation
  - Counseling
  - Academic advising
  - Residence life
  - Co-curricular programming
  - Career counseling

The role of theory

- Theory is the result of the need we have to make sense of life.
- Developing interventions without a theoretical base is not effective or efficient.
- Practices based on intuition, experience, etc., can be successful, but there are no guarantees that this approach is appropriate or can be reproduced.

Practice without a theoretical base is not effective or efficient. A “fly by the seat of your pants” approach may sometimes result in beneficial outcomes, but it is just as likely to result in disaster.

Student Development in College
Nancy Evans, Deanna Forney, Florence Guido-DeBrito...
Educators can benefit from knowledge of theories, including:

- Student development theory
- Career development theory
- Learning theory
- Decision-making theory
- Racial identity theory
- Personality theory
- Moral development theory
- Adult development theory

Theories can’t tell us what behaviors or changes are best for students.

Theories must be evaluated in light of individual differences...

Parker, Widick, and Knefelkamp, 1978

It is important for advisors to have some understanding of student development because a student’s personal development has a direct bearing on whether s/he is ready to pursue academic and personal goals.

Giving Advice to Students,

Failure to understand students’ ethnic and racial identity development can lead to inappropriate and ineffective responses on campus.

Hardiman and Jackson, 1992
The use of racial identity theories is the first critical step for faculty, administrators, and students to develop the critical multicultural competency of awareness.

*Identity Development of Diverse Populations*
Torres, Howard-Hamilton, Cooper, 2003

What is development?

Not simply change, which is an altered condition that could be positive or negative, or growth, which refers to expansion that could be favorable or unfavorable. (Sanford, 1967)

Development refers to the ways students grow, progress, and increase their capabilities as a result of being in college. (Rodgers 1990)

The college environment can either facilitate or inhibit students’ development.

Douglas Heath, 1968

Identity Development
Erik Erikson *Identity: Youth and Crisis, 1968*

- Identity formation is one of the central tasks of adolescence.
- Adolescents must resolve issues about *the self* in order to arrive at the stable sense of self described as *achieved identity.*
Identity Development
Erik Erikson *Identity: Youth and Crisis*, 1968

- Adolescents experience a series of "crises, or turning points, where they can either move forward (progress) or go back (regress).

According to Erikson, *ethnic identity* is a process located both in the core of the individual and her/his communal culture…

Identity: A sense of who one is and what one stands for in the world.

DEVELOPMENTAL TASKS FOR TRADITIONAL-AGED STUDENTS

- Developing competence
- Managing emotions
- Developing autonomy and interdependence
- Establishing identity
- Developing mature relationships
- Developing purpose
- Developing integrity

Arthur Chickering & Linda Reisser

The establishment of identity is the core developmental issue with which students grapple while they are in college.

Chickering & Reisser
Identity includes a sense of one's social and cultural heritage, a clear self concept, and a secure sense of self.

Chickering and Reisser, 1993

Identity Development in Adolescence?

- Who am I now?
- Who was I before?
- What will I become?

At minimum, identity development formation embodies a commitment to:

- sexual orientation
- ideological stance (e.g., political, religious)
- vocational direction.

James Marcia, 1980

Theories of Identity Development

- Josselson’s Theory of *Identity Development in Women*.
- Cass’s Model of *Homosexual Identity Formation for Persons Who Are Gay, Lesbian, or Bisexual*.
- Schlossberg’s *Transition Theory for Adults*
- Gibson’s Disability identity development model
What is “racial identity”?
A sense of group or collective identity based on one’s perception that s/he shares a common racial heritage with a particular group.
Janet Helms, 1993

Theories of Ethnic and Racial Identity Development
- Asian (Kim, 1981; Sue and Sue, 1990)
- Bi-racial (Kerwin & Ponterotto, 1995; Poston, 1990)
- Latino/Hispanic (Ruiz, 1990; Padilla 1995)
- Native American (Choney, et al 1995, Horse, 2001)
- White (Corvin and Wiggins, 1988; Helms, 1993)

Racial Identity Theory (RIT)
For people of color in the US, developing a healthy identity and psychological well-being remains a constant challenge in the face of persistent discrimination.
Derek Kenji Iwamoto & William Ming Liu
Journal of Counseling Psychology 2010

A post-racial America?
- Racial attitudes toward African-Americans have worsened since the election of President Barack Obama.
- 51 percent of whites now express explicit anti-black attitudes, compared with 48 percent in 2008.
Stanford University, University of Michigan, University of Chicago poll for AP, 2012
Racial Identity Theory (RIT)

RIT describes the process of how members of racially oppressed groups respond to and internalize race-related stress and discrimination into their overall identity or self-consciousness.

Alvin Alvarez & Janet Helms

Some cautions...

- All models have some value
- All models have some limitations
- All models are linear, while life experiences often are not
- Models can extend beyond the defined group

Rosetta Eun Ryong Lee, 2011

American Indian Identity Development
Perry Horse, 2001

Centered around the idea of consciousness
- Individual’s knowledge of language and culture, emphasizes the assumed identity.
- Individual’s consciousness is increased by the awareness and comprehension of the tribe’s history
- Adoption of worldview consistent with traditions and culture of his or her heritage
- The amount of emphasis and individual places on his or her American Indian heritage

Asian American Identity Development Model
Jean Kim, 1981

1. Ethnic awareness stage: positive or neutral attitudes toward one’s ethnic origin are formed depending on amount of ethnic exposure by caretakers.
2. White Identification stage: begins when children enter school where peers convey racial prejudice that negatively affects self-esteem and identity. Realization of “differentness” leads to self-blame and a desire to escape their racial heritage and identify with White society.
3. **Awakening to Social Political Consciousness stage**: adoption of a new perspective, with a primary result being abandonment of identification with white society, and a consequent understanding of racial oppression.

4. **Redirection stage**: reconnection with one’s Asian heritage and culture. Anger against White racism may emerge and become a defining theme.

---

I went to school with kids I grew up with. They always accepted me for who I was and the fact that I’m Asian didn’t ever really come up. Now, I’m in college and I’m a “minority student,” and people have all kinds of preconceived ideas about who I am. They don’t know even know the difference between a Filipino, a Chinese, or a Korean. I find myself wanting to know more about my ethnicity and sometimes I get angry at how I’m being treated….

First-year Asian American woman

---

5. **Incorporation stage**: The highest form of identity evolution, which encompasses the development of positive and comfortable identity as Asian American and a consequent respect for other racial/cultural heritages. Identification for or against White culture is no longer an important issue.

---

**Asian Pacific American Groups**

- Asian Indian
- Chinese
- Filipino
- Guamanian
- Hawaiian
- Hmong
- Japanese
- Korean
- Laotian
- Pakistani
- Samoan
- Thai
- Vietnamese

- **Philippines**: 7000 islands
  - 100 languages

**DIVERSITY IN DIVERSITY**
Challenging the Monolithic Asian American Identity

There are many ethnicities which comprise Asian America, and each carries their own distinct histories and cultures... The use of Asian American as an umbrella category can obscure demographic differences that need to be addressed.

A context for working with South Asian American Students
Viraj Patel, The Vermont Connection, 2010, Vol. 31

Black/African American Identity Development Model
William Cross, 1971

1. Pre-encounter
2. Encounter
3. Immersion
4. Emersion
5. Internalization

The Autobiography of Malcolm X
An Example of Racial Identity Development

One behavior that has a large impact on the responsiveness of African American males is when white faculty respond to the cultural and/or racial content of their comments rather than ignoring or "not hearing" those comments.

Addressing the Pitfalls of White Faculty/Black Male Student Communication.
Lisa M. Gonsalves, 2002
Latina/o American Identity Development Model
Pedro Ruiz, 1990

Casual: Affirmation of ethnic heritage is lacking; the person may experience traumatic or humiliating experiences related to ethnicity, leading to a failure to identify with Latin@ culture.

Cognitive: As a result of negative/distorted messages, three belief systems are incorporated into mental sets about Latin@ heritage:
1. association with poverty & prejudice;
2. assimilation to White society as the only escape;
3. assimilation as the only road to success.

In the closet

My reality, my identity, is an invisible one...I am supposed to be "in the shadows." Not having legal status affects every single thing I do, on or off campus. While HSU tries to make me feel included, this is not a reality...I can relate to the LGBTQ community members ad how part of their identity is in a "closet."

Mi Rialidad, My Reality

Latina/o American Identity Development Model
Pedro Ruiz, 1990

Consequence: Fragmentation of identity; person become ashamed by ethnic markers (e.g. skin color, accent, cultural customs). Estrangement and rejection of Latin@ heritage.

Working Through: Person becomes unable to cope with the psychological distress of ethnic identity conflict and can no longer be a “pretender,” and is propelled to reclaim and reintegrate disowned fragments. Consciousness increases. (Anger at White culture may manifest as a reaction to previous stages.)

Yo soy Joaquin
Rodolfo "Corky" Gonzales

I am Joaquin, Lost in a world of confusion. Caught up in the world of gringo society, Confused by the rules, Scorned by the attitudes, Suppressed by manipulations, and destroyed by modern society....

Yo soy Joaquin

Perdido en un mundo de confusión, Enganchado en remolino de una sociedad gringa, Confundido por las reglas, Despreciado por las actitudes, Sofocado por manipulaciones, y destrozado por la sociedad moderna....
Successful resolution: Exemplified by a greater acceptance of culture and ethnicity. Improvement in self esteem and a sense that one’s ethnic identity is a positive and success promoting resource.

Based on the idea that racial identity is a secondary identity in Latin@ culture. Six orientations as opposed to stages

Latino-Integrated: Individuals understands our society in terms of race and identified with the larger Latino community

Latino-Identified: Individuals believe race is fluid and society is a dualistic construction of race.

Subgroup-Identified: Individuals have strong identification with specific subgroup within the Latino culture, belief that all other subgroups are subordinate

Diversity in Diversity: Latino/Hispanic

- Twenty Spanish and Portuguese speaking countries in the Western Hemisphere
- Often “Latino” is used in contrast to others who are not Spanish speaking
- Often identify based on country of origin (e.g., Mexico, Puerto Rico, Cuba)
Latina/o American Identity Development Model
Bernardo Ferdman & Placida Gallegos, 2001

Latino as other
Individuals who hold no stake in a subgroup, often cause by the uncertainty of his or her heritage.

Undifferentiated/denial
Individuals claim a color-blind mentality and race is not important.

White Identified
Individuals identify as white and the view, values and beliefs as such.

Racial Identity Development
Hispanic/Latino/a students must integrate three worlds:
1. *Familia y la comunidad *
2. The academic world
3. The “self” which emerges from combining these worlds.

Entre Dos Mundos
We help Latino/a students to succeed by assisting them to develop and create their own identities while balancing disparate cultural demands.

“Cultural Identity Development in Latino Adolescents” Bacallo & Snokoski, 2005

Acculturation
To live in the borderlands means you are neither hispana, India, negra, espanola ni gabacha, eres mestiza, mulata, half breed. Caught in the crossfire between camps while carrying five races on your back not knowing which side to turn to, run from… To survive in the Borderlands you must live sin fronteras—be a crossroads.

Gloria Anzaldua, 1987
Racial identity attitudes influence students’ decisions about classes, peers, faculty, advisors, counselors, even the extent to which they identify or disidentify with academic work.

During the encounter and immersion phases of racial identity development, when the search for identity leads toward a stereotypical image of what it means to “be Black or Latino”, moving away from anything thought to be “White” may also lead to a decline in academic performance.

Oppressed and oppressor

- Most of us will find that we are both dominant and targeted at the same time [but] the targeted identities hold our attention and the dominant identities go unexamined.
- We assume the targeted identity to be the primary cause of all oppression, forgetting other distortions around difference, some of which we are ourselves practicing.

*Age, Race, Class & Sex: Women Defining Difference*  
Audre Lord, 1995

White Identity Development

**Pre-exposure/Acceptance:** Little awareness or thought given to race. Denial of race problems. Belief that minorities should assimilate with White (superior) culture. Refusal to acknowledge difference—people are people.

**Encounter:** confronts the reality of racism they didn’t think, or want, to believe still exists. Forced to exam their role as white in the US. Feelings of guilt or anger, but failure to see one’s own racism.
**White Identity Development**

**Zealot-Defensive:** One of two responses:

1. Taking on the “minority plight” and anti-racism.
2. Taking criticism of white racism personally and retreating back into white culture and refraining from multicultural associations, so as to maintain their worldview.

**Integration:** Individuals become balanced, more open, less defensive, with respect for cultural difference, & interest in learning more.

---

**Identity Development in Adolescence**

Beverly D. Tatum, Ph.D.

"Why Are All the Black Kids Sitting Together in the Cafeteria?"

---

Adolescents of color are more likely to be actively engaged in an exploration of their racial or ethnic identity/identities than are White adolescents.
What does it mean to be…
*Asian?*
*Black?*
*Latino?*
*Native American?*

White people rarely give much thought to being White.

Frankenberg, 1993

Our self perceptions are shaped by the messages we receive from those around us.

As our race comes to matter to others, it comes to matter more to us.

Identity development models clarify the impact that being socialized in a hostile environment has on students of color.

*Brown and Rivas, 1995*
Students on campus who experience a system of oppression every day have tremendous difficulty maintaining good grades, communicating with classmates, connecting with faculty, and feeling comfortable... These issues become the survival behaviors they focus on that can delay other developmental issues.

*Identity Development of Diverse Populations*, Vasti Torres, Mary Howard-Hooper, & Diane Cooper, 2003

Key Question:

How can I act to encourage students who are in the majority to reach out to include students who are in the minority?

Flying Under the Radar

Taylor McCulloch

When I began my education at HSU four years ago, I thought I was a well rounded person. I assumed because I didn’t say racial slurs or use homophobic language that I was an ally for marginalized groups. As I continue my education, I became more aware of the hypocrisy in my own life,...

I want to help educate the white population at HSU... to be even more aware of covert racism.

White students are shocked and appalled when they discover that there is so much more to learn about the history of diverse groups and that their current level of education is woefully inadequate. They realize that what they were taught in elementary and secondary school may have been written to favor privileged groups.

Torres, Howard-Hooper, Cooper, 2003
Supporting the Identity Development of Students of Color

- Understand Minority Identity Development
- Encourage courses related to students’ ethnicities
- Know about and refer students to offices and programs serving students of color on campus
- Be familiar with campus organizations and activities for students of color
- Encourage students to seek out campus and community mentors

Questions to consider
- How can I apply this to:
  - Classroom teaching
  - Improving climate—classroom and beyond
  - Orientation
  - Counseling
  - Academic advising
  - Residence life
  - Co-curricular programming
  - Career counseling

Implications and applications

1. What was the most significant learning point you gained from this presentation?
2. How can you apply what you learned to your work with students—individually, collectively?
3. What other thoughts or questions do you have about this topic?

Humboldt State University
Institute for Student Success
January 16, 2014

Thomas Brown
thm@tbrownassociates.com
www.tbrownassociates.com